



CREED VS DEED

JEWISH THOUGHT VS JEWISH ACTION

THE HUFFINGTON POST: 'CANNIBAL COP' TRIAL

NEW YORK — A New York police officer charged with conspiring to kill and eat women does not plan to testify at his Manhattan trial, making it likely that the trial is nearing its end.

Defense lawyers for Officer Gilberto Valle notified the judge that the 28-year-old Queens resident will not be testifying. Sergey Merenkov, 34, testified on Feb. 19 that he and partners started the website in 2010 to create a Facebook-like environment for people with kinky fantasies. Prosecutors say Valle met co-conspirators interested in capturing, raping, killing, cooking and eating women on the site.

He testified that the majority of the website's 4,500 active users – 25 percent of which he estimates to be women – are in the United States or Europe.

A prosecutor asked him if some subjects discussed on the website would be illegal if they were carried out, such as sex with dead bodies, one of the site's more popular subjects.

"Yes, but reality is one thing and fantasy is completely a different thing," he responded.

Merenkov's testimony was aimed at supporting defense arguments that Valle was role-playing when he spoke in dramatic details with others on the Internet about killing and cooking at least six women he knew, including his wife.

After prosecutors finished showing their evidence Monday, defense attorney Edward Vas argued Valle should be exonerated by the judge because the government failed to show there was "a true second participant" in the supposed conspiracy, only fellow role-playing Internet friends.

The judge did not immediately rule. The government has conceded that Valle never met the purported Internet co-conspirators and that no women were harmed.

Valle was arrested in October after his wife discovered the chats on his computer and fled their home, turning a computer over to the FBI in Reno, Nev. He was charged with conspiring to kidnap, kill and eat women, which carries the potential for a life sentence. He also faces a lesser charge that he illegally accessed a national crime database to research kidnap targets.

- **IN YOUR OPINION— WHICH IS MORE IMPORTANT, INTENTION OR ACTION?**
- **DO YOU THINK INTENTION WITHOUT ACTION IS PUNISHABLE?**
- **DO YOU THINK ACTION WITHOUT INTENTION IS MEANINGLESS?**



KUZARI: FIFTH ESSAY

26. The Kuzari said: "Since you believe in everything you have said, God already knows your inner feelings. 'The Merciful One desires the heart.'²⁴³ He knows hidden things and reveals secrets. [Why, then, must you actually go to Eretz-Yisrael?]"

27. [1] The Rabbi said: "That is true only when one is prevented from acting. But in general, a person finds that his will is situated between himself and his desires and deeds.²⁴⁴ [Before one actually does a good deed, it exists only potentially. And since one cannot receive a reward until he actually performs the deed,] one

is guilty if he does not bring forth actual reward through actual good deeds. This is why it states, 'and you shall blow the trumpets, and you will be remembered before the Lord your God... and they shall act as a reminder of you before your God.'²⁴⁵ It also states, 'A remembrance through blowing [of the ram's horn].'²⁴⁶ This does not mean that God needs a reminder or rousing; however, a person's actions must be optimal, and only then is he worthy of reward.

[2] "In a similar vein, [in order for] one's prayers [to be accepted, they] must be expressed verbally in the form of supplication and request, in the best possible way.

[3] "Once both the intent and the deed have been completed satisfactorily, they are rewarded. This reward is what the Torah refers to — in human terms — as being 'remembered' by God, since 'the Torah speaks in the idiom of human terminology.'²⁴⁷ If, however, the deed lacks the proper intent, or the intent has not combined with the proper deed, then the objective is lost.

כו. אמר הפוזרי: כִּאֲשֶׁר אַתָּה מֵאֲמִין בְּכֹל מֵה שֶׁזָּכַרְתָּ בְּבֵר יְדַע הָאֵל מֵצִפּוֹנָה, וְרַחֲמָנָא לְבָא בְּעֵי, יוֹדֵעַ הַמֵּצִפּוֹנִים וּמְגַלֵּה הַנְּסִתְרוֹת.

כו. אמר החבר: זה אמת כִּאֲשֶׁר יִמְנַע הַמַּעֲשֵׂה, אֲכַל הָאָדָם מִנְּחָ לֹו בֵּינוּ וּבֵין מֵאֲוִיו וּמַעֲשָׂהוּ, וְהָאָדָם נֹאשֵׁם כִּאֲשֶׁר אֵינְנוּ מוֹבִיא הַשָּׂכָר הַנִּרְאָה אֶל הַמַּעֲשֵׂה הַטּוֹב הַנִּרְאָה, וְעַל כֵּן נֹאמַר: "וְהִרְעַתֶּם בַּחֲצֹצְרוֹת וְנִזְכַּרְתֶּם לִפְנֵי יְיָ אֱלֹהֵיכֶם... וְהָיוּ לָכֶם לְזִכְרוֹן לִפְנֵי אֱלֹהֵיכֶם," "זְכָרוֹן תְּרוּעָה". לֹא שֶׁהָאֱלֹהִים צְרִיךְ אֶל הַזְּכָרָה וְהַעֲרָה, אֲךָ שֶׁהַמַּעֲשִׂים צְרִיכִים לְשִׁלְמוֹת וְאִזּוּ יִהְיוּ רְאוּיִים לְגִמּוּל. כִּאֲשֶׁר צְרִיכִים עֲנִי הַתְּפִלָּה לְבִטּוֹא בָהֶם עַל הַשְּׁלֵמוֹת הַגָּמוּר מִהַתְחַנָּה וְהַבְּקוּשָׁה.

וּכִאֲשֶׁר יִהְיֶה הַמַּעֲשֵׂה וְהַכּוֹנֵן שְׁלֵמִים כְּרְאוּי, יִהְיֶה עֲלֵיהֶם הַגָּמוּל, וְיִהְיֶה זֶה עַל דְּרָה בְּנֵי אָדָם כְּאֵלוֹ הוּא זְכָרוֹן, וְדַבְרָה תּוֹרָה כְּלִשׁוֹן בְּנֵי אָדָם. וְאִם הִנֵּה הַמַּעֲשֵׂה בְּלִעְדֵי כּוֹנֵן אוֹ כּוֹנֵן בְּלִתֵּי מַעֲשֵׂה, תֵּאבֵד הַתּוֹחֵלֶת.

- IS HAVING GOOD INTENTIONS ENOUGH TO BE REWARDED OR ONE IS ONLY REWARDED BY GOOD DEEDS?
- WHAT DOES RAV YEHUDAH HALEVI BELIEVE TO BE MORE IMPORTANT, ACTIONS OR INTENTIONS?